



Objection 434

Kieran Simpson

5 pages

Kieran Simpson

██████████
Blackburn North
VICTORIA ██████████

████████████████████

To the AEC Commissioners,

I would like to raise an objection to the proposed boundaries for the electorates of Menzies and Deakin as part of the 2024 Victorian redistribution.

As part of my proposal I will reference electoral boundaries for the electorates of Menzies and Deakin that were in use for the 2016, 2019, and 2022 federal elections, as well as Victorian state and council boundaries. Due to the file size limitation of the AEC submission form, at the end, links will be provided to copies of maps.

For context, the suburb I live in has changed federal electorates for the last three federal elections. This lack of continuity affects myself, my neighbours and my broader community in terms of federal representation and engagement. I know of community groups that have had to recreate relationships with representatives as a result of repeated changes which impacts the ability of those groups to meet their objectives in the community. Because of the geographical nature of the area in which I live, it is possible that boundary changes will occur again in the future if the AEC proceeds with the current proposals for these electorates as part of the 2024 redistribution. I aim to propose an alternative set of boundaries that would minimise change in the future while also uniting multiple tiers of government to better serve the community. These changes would also not require too much alteration to the overall redistribution making them easier to apply.

The proposed borders will see the council areas of Manningham, Maroondah and Whitehorse continue to be divided across federal boundaries, as well as the state electorates of Box Hill, Ringwood and Warrandyte. The proposed borders for Menzies take in more of the Whitehorse council area as well as the majority of the state seat of Box Hill. However, the Eastern Freeway/Koonung creek is a consistent boundary used by government, community and sporting groups to define areas. The suburbs of Blackburn, Blackburn North, Blackburn South, Box Hill North, Box Hill and Box Hill South have more overlap in terms of sporting communities/associations/leagues, community groups and faith groups than with the suburbs north of the Eastern Freeway such as Doncaster, Donvale, Templestowe, etc. For example, many families in those suburbs would play sport as part of a club within one of those suburbs, where the families of other teams in the competition also reside within those suburbs. Or will reside further to the east within suburbs inside the Whitehorse council area such as Mitcham, Nunawading, Vermont, Vermont South, etc and some suburbs within the Maroondah council area such as Ringwood, etc. But not north of the Eastern Freeway/Koonung Creek. Examples include the Box Hill Reporter District Cricket Association, or the teams that use the Box Hill Action Indoor Sports for indoor cricket, netball, soccer, etc. It is better to keep these suburbs united within a federal electorate rather than splitting them multiple ways.

Having Menzies cross the Eastern Freeway/Koonung Creek has led to an “electorate of two halves” with different demographics, socio-economic status, issues and concerns.

In previous redistributions for Deakin and Menzies, the AEC have mostly followed council or state electorate boundaries, for example in the 2021 and 2018 redistributions.

With the removal of the electorate of Higgins in the 2024 draft redistribution, I propose the following boundary changes for Menzies and Deakin:

1. Revert Menzies to a shape similar to what it was at the 2019 election (2018 boundaries). This would see the Eastern Freeway/Koonung Creek remain the southern boundary of Menzies. It would see the areas of Donvale, Park Orchids, and Ringwood North returned from Deakin. The area of Wonga Park would also return from Casey. The area of North Warrandyte should stay in Jagajaga as per the 2024 suggestion as it is also in the Nillumbik council region. This would see the council area of Manningham and the state electorate of Warrandyte be wholly or mostly contained within Menzies.
2. The border of Deakin with Menzies should follow the existing proposed boundary until the Eastern Freeway where the border should continue to follow the council border between Whitehorse and Manningham; similar to the 2019 election boundary. This restores the delineation that already exists between suburbs and communities back into the federal boundaries.
3. To compensate for the returning of areas to Menzies, Deakin should continue west to Union Road to cover the area of the Box Hill state district that is currently in Chisholm/Menzies. The southern boundary could remain as is proposed, or move to Burwood Highway to match the state district's boundaries. The northern boundary would continue along the Eastern Freeway/Koonung Creek. This would unite the state district of Box Hill, and Ringwood as well as the majority of the Whitehorse and Maroondah council areas within a single federal electorate.
4. If there are too many electors in Deakin as a result, compromises could include
 - a. Moving the western boundary of Deakin to Elgar Road which is currently a boundary between Chisholm, Menzies and Kooyong which would see electors in Mont Albert, Mont Albert North and Surrey Hills remain in Kooyong. Although not ideal, it would see electors not change electorates which achieves continuity for those electors.
 - b. Moving the border between Menzies and Deakin to follow a similar path at the 2016 election along Oban Road, Wonga Road, Plymouth Road, etc, while still keeping the Eastern Freeway/Koonung creek as a boundary.
 - c. Have the federal border follow the border between the state districts of Ringwood and Warrandyte (and Box Hill where the border is on the Eastern Freeway/Koonung Creek).

- d. Have the federal border follow Maroondah Highway east of the intersection of Springvale Road/Eastern Freeway. Similar to the 2016 boundary while moving Ringwood North into Menzies.

4.b, 4.c, and 4.d would see the number of electors in Menzies increase which would compensate for no changes to other proposed borders such as the boundary between Menzies and Jagajaga and would be ideal for balancing the geographical nature of the two electorates with the current population of electors.

The aim of my proposal is to minimise future change, unite federal, state and government areas where possible, and respect the preexisting divisions between community and sporting groups. I think my suggested changes would have minimal impact and be easy to achieve and lead to a more representative division of federal representation.

I thank the Commissioners for their time.

Regards,
Kieran Simpson

Map References

2024 Proposed Boundaries Deakin and Menzies

- <https://www.aec.gov.au/redistributions/2023/vic/proposed-redistribution/maps/a4/2024-AEC-Victoria-A4-Menzies-Proposed.pdf>
- <https://www.aec.gov.au/redistributions/2023/vic/proposed-redistribution/maps/A4/2024-AEC-Victoria-A4-Deakin-Proposed.pdf>

2021 Boundaries of Deakin and Menzies (2022 election)

- <https://www.aec.gov.au/Electorates/Redistributions/2021/vic/final-report/files/maps-a4/2021-AEC-Victoria-A4-Deakin-Final.pdf>
- <https://www.aec.gov.au/Electorates/Redistributions/2021/vic/final-report/files/maps-a4/2021-AEC-Victoria-A4-Menzies-Final.pdf>

2018 Boundaries of Deakin and Menzies (2019 election)

- <https://www.aec.gov.au/redistributions/2017/vic/final-report/files/maps-a4/2018-AEC-Victoria-A4-Deakin-Final.pdf>
- <https://www.aec.gov.au/redistributions/2017/vic/final-report/files/maps-a4/2018-AEC-Victoria-A4-Menzies-Final.pdf>

2010 Boundaries of Deakin and Menzies (2016, 2013 elections)

- <https://www.aec.gov.au/Electorates/Redistributions/2010/vic/index.htm>

Victorian State Electorate Boundaries

- Box Hill - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/state-districts/box-hill-district>
- Ringwood - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/state-districts/ringwood-district>
- Warrandyte - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/state-districts/warrandyte-district>

Victorian Council Areas Boundaries

- Manningham - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/local-councils/manningham-city-council>

- Maroondah - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/local-councils/maroondah-city-council>
- Whitehorse - <https://www.vec.vic.gov.au/electoral-boundaries/local-councils/whitehorse-city-council>